



**Legislative Assembly
Province of Alberta**

No. 30

VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS

Fourth Session

Twenty-Fourth Legislature

Tuesday, April 18, 2000

The Speaker took the Chair at 1:30 p.m.

Presenting Petitions

Mr. Lougheed, Hon. Member for Clover Bar-Fort Saskatchewan, presented a petition from 140 Albertans supporting the reinstatement of front license plates in Alberta.

Mr. Johnson, Hon. Member for Wetaskiwin-Camrose, presented a petition from 121 Albertans urging the Government to reinstate front license plates in Alberta.

Ms Blakeman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Centre, presented a petition from 63 Edmonton residents regarding the addition of newer and more effective medications and therapies to the Alberta drug list.

Mr. MacDonald, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Gold Bar, presented a petition from 571 Albertans requesting the introduction of a Bill requiring a minimum of two people on shifts from dark to daylight.

Mr. Gibbons, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Manning, presented a petition from 239 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mr. White, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Calder, presented a petition from 245 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mr. Sapers, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glenora, presented a petition from 75 Edmonton residents supporting adequate funding for medicare and opposing private for-profit hospitals.

Mr. Sapers, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glenora, presented a petition from 143 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mrs. Sloan, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Riverview, presented a petition from 280 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Ms Olsen, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Norwood, presented a petition from 276 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Ms Leibovici, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Meadowlark, presented a petition from 136 Edmonton residents urging the Legislative Assembly to reinvest in the public health care system rather than supporting private for-profit health care.

Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona, presented a petition from 531 Albertans requesting the introduction of a bill banning the establishment of private for-profit hospitals in Alberta to maintain the integrity of the public, universal health care system.

Reading and Receiving Petitions

On request by Mrs. O'Neill, Hon. Member for St. Albert, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned residents of Alberta petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to provide respective Regional Health Authorities with the flexibility necessary to provide the delivery of publicly funded, publicly administered overnight surgical services cost-effectively and efficiently through the contracting-out of such services if deemed necessary.

On request by Mr. Dickson, Hon. Member for Calgary-Buffalo, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Mr. Wickman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Rutherford, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Mr. Bonner, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glengarry, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Mrs. Soetaert, Hon. Member for Spruce Grove-Sturgeon-St. Albert, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Mr. MacDonald, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Gold Bar, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned residents of the Province of Alberta, hereby petition the Legislative Assembly to pass a bill banning private for-profit hospitals in Alberta so that the integrity of the public, universal health care system may be maintained.

Presenting Reports by Standing and Special Committees

Ms Graham, Chairman, Select Standing Committee on Private Bills, presented the following report:

Mr. Speaker, the Select Standing Committee on Private Bills has had certain Bills under consideration and wishes to report as follows:

The Committee recommends that the following Private Bills proceed:

- Bill Pr1 Benevolent and Protective Order of Elks of the Province of Alberta Repeal Act — Mr. Coutts
- Bill Pr2 William Roper Hull Child and Family Services Amendment Act, 2000 — Mr. Stevens
- Bill Pr4 Calgary Municipal Heritage Properties Authority Amendment Act, 2000 — Mrs. Laing
- Bill Pr5 Calgary Foundation Act — Mrs. Burgener

Mr. Speaker, I request the concurrence of the Assembly in these recommendations.

The question being put, concurrence in the report was granted.

Notices of Motions

Pursuant to Standing Order 34(2)(a), Mr. Zwozdesky, Deputy Government House Leader, gave oral notice of the following Written Questions and Motions for Returns to be dealt with Wednesday, April 19, 2000:

Written Questions: WQ14, WQ15, WQ16.

Motions for Returns: MR29, MR31, MR32, MR36, MR37, MR38, MR42.

Tabling Returns and Reports

Hon. Dr. West, Acting Provincial Treasurer:

Response to Written Question WQ231 asked for by Mr. Sapers on December 8, 1999:

What information has been prepared by or for Alberta Treasury on the revenue recovery or the economic offset of the \$600 million single rate tax proposal for 2003-04, 2004-05, 2005-06, and 2006-07, and how much of the revenue recovery or economic offset in each fiscal year is accounted for by the elimination of the 8% surtax, the elimination of the 0.5% flat tax, the increase in the personal and spousal exemptions to \$11,620, the increase in the personal and spousal exemptions in the 1999 federal budget, and the introduction of the 11% single rate?

Sessional Paper 649/2000

Response to Written Question WQ232 asked for by Mr. Sapers on December 8, 1999:

What information has been prepared by or for Alberta Treasury on how much of the \$120 million economic offset or revenue recovery projected in 2002-03, as cited on page 17 of Budget 1999: Government of Alberta Fiscal Plan, results from the elimination of the 8% surtax, from the increase in the personal and spousal exemptions contained in the 1999 federal budget, from the elimination of the 0.5% flat tax, from the increase in the personal and spousal exemptions to \$11,620, and from the introduction of the 11% single rate?

Sessional Paper 650/2000

Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona:

Letter, undated, from Norman Conner, Edmonton, to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, and letter dated April 10, 2000, from Reverend Janni Belgum, United Church of Canada, Calgary Presbytery, to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, and Hon. Mr. Jonson, Minister of Health and Wellness, both expressing concerns regarding Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act

Sessional Paper 651/2000

2 letters dated February 8, 2000, from Jaana Wilkinson and Meagan Nishio, both of Canmore, expressing opposition to the Genesis Land Corporation development in the Spray Valley of Kananaskis Country

Sessional Paper 652/2000

Mr. Wickman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Rutherford:

Letter dated April 10, 2000, from Elsa Robinson, Edmonton, to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, expressing opposition to, and requesting the withdrawal of, Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act

Sessional Paper 653/2000

6 e-mail messages from Brigid McGarry, Carol Ward, Christina Arnold, Mima Cecchetti, Charlene Ball, and one unnamed, to Mr. Wickman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Rutherford, expressing opposition to Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act

Sessional Paper 654/2000

E-mail message dated April 17, 2000, from John Zurawell, Edmonton, to Mrs. MacBeth, Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition, Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona, and Mr. Wickman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Rutherford, with an attached letter from Mr. Zurawell to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, expressing opposition to Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act

Sessional Paper 655/2000

2 e-mail messages, both undated, from Andree-Ann Thivierge, Edmonton, and Keith Leal, Pincher Creek, to Members of the Legislative Assembly (MLAs) expressing opposition to Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act

Sessional Paper 656/2000

2 e-mail messages, both undated and unaddressed, from Eldred Stamp and Tom St. Clair, Calgary, expressing opposition to Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act

Sessional Paper 657/2000

List dated April 17, 2000, of names of 25 people who have called the office of Mr. Wickman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Rutherford, expressing their opposition to Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act

Sessional Paper 658/2000

Ms Leibovici, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Meadowlark:

Letter, undated, from Meredith McKague, MD, CCFP, to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, expressing opposition to, and concerns regarding Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act

Sessional Paper 659/2000

Mr. Dickson, Hon. Member for Calgary-Buffalo:

Letter dated April 17, 2000, from Mr. Dickson, Official Opposition House Leader, to Hon. Mr. Hancock, Government House Leader, responding to Mr. Hancock's letter of April 13, 2000, expressing concerns about the 14 proposed Government amendments to Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act and the difficulty by the Official Opposition to introduce amendments because of the time it will take to dispose of the Government amendments, and questioning whether the Government will address certain issues regarding Bill 11

Sessional Paper 660/2000

3 letters dated February 8, 2000, from John MacLeod, Riley McGurk and Damian Martin-Lamartine, all of Canmore, expressing opposition to the Genesis Land Corporation development in the Spray Valley of Kananaskis Country

Sessional Paper 661/2000

Mr. MacDonald, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Gold Bar:

E-mail message dated April 11, 2000, from Bob Blakey, Calgary, to Mrs. MacBeth, Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition, urging the Government to use its legislative powers to assist striking Calgary Herald workers in obtaining their first collective agreement

Sessional Paper 662/2000

Dr. Massey, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Mill Woods:

Summary, dated March 2000 of meetings held between the Council of University Students (CAUS) and Members of the Legislative Assembly (MLAs) regarding tuition fees and loan arrangements, prepared by the Council of Alberta University Students

Sessional Paper 663/2000

Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona:

Edmonton Journal article dated April 18, 2000, entitled "Government gave false impression Bill 11 backed by RNs, association says"

Sessional Paper 664/2000

Mr. Sapers, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glenora:

Letter dated October 23, 1996, from Mr. Sapers, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glenora, to Hon. Mr. Jonson, Minister of Health and Wellness, requesting a copy of the standard service delivery contract used by the 17 health regions, and attaching a letter dated January 23, 1995, from Hon. Mrs. McClellan, former Minister of Health, clarifying several aspects of the process for restructuring the delivery of laboratory services

Sessional Paper 665/2000

Flyer distributed at rallies held in Calgary and Edmonton on April 15, and 16, 2000, providing information on how to use the Internet to vote against Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act

Sessional Paper 666/2000

Further update of Government of Alberta website document, undated, entitled "Bill 11 Debate Summary for April 11, 2000"

Sessional Paper 667/2000

Mrs. Sloan, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Riverview:

21 letters to Mrs. Sloan, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Riverview, Mrs. Gordon, Hon. Member for Lacombe-Stettler, and Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, from constituents of Edmonton-Riverview, expressing opposition to Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act

Sessional Paper 668/2000

Final report dated April 2000, entitled "Children and Youth in Care Review: Listen to Their Voices" prepared by The Saskatchewan Children's Advocate Office

Sessional Paper 669/2000

Mr. White, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Calder:

Letter dated February 22, 2000, from Peter J. Vermeulen, Calgary, to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, expressing opposition to the Genesis Land Development Corporation's proposed development of the Spray Lakes area in Kananaskis Country

Sessional Paper 670/2000

Letter dated February 22, 2000, from Clive M. Pyburn, Ph.D., Canmore, to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, expressing admiration for the Government's achievements regarding elimination of the deficit and paying down the debt, and expressing opposition to the Genesis Land Development Corporation's proposed development of the Spray Lakes area in Kananaskis Country

Sessional Paper 671/2000

Ms Carlson, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Ellerslie:

2 letters dated March 7, 2000, from Steve Arthur, Calgary, to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, and March 2, 2000, from R. Bruce Green, Calgary, to Ms Carlson, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Ellerslie, expressing opposition to the proposed terms of reference submitted by Genesis Land Development Corporation for a development in the Spray Valley area of Kananaskis Country, and urging the Government to include the public in an evaluation of the environmental, social, and economic consequences of any development in Spray Valley

Sessional Paper 672/2000

Mr. Bonner, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glengarry:

2 letters dated March 8, 2000, from Dicksie E. Helm, Red Deer, to Ms Carlson, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Ellerslie, and March 6, 2000, from Martha McCallum, Canmore, expressing opposition to the Genesis Land Development Corporation's proposed development of the Spray Lakes area in Kananaskis Country

Sessional Paper 673/2000

Ms Blakeman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Centre:

Letter dated April 5, 2000, from Nan Schuurmans, MD, FRCSC, Obstetrician-Gynaecologist, Medical Director, Menopause Clinic; David A. Hanley, MD, FRCPC, Endocrinologist, and Professor and Head; Division of Endocrinology, University of Calgary; John R. Mackey, MD, FRCPC, ABIM, Medical Oncologist, Cross Cancer Institute, and Associate Director, Breast Cancer International Research Group, University of Alberta; and Brian Wirzba, MD, FRCPC, General Internist, Medical Director, Osteoporosis Clinic and Associate Clinical Professor, University of Alberta, to Hon. Mr. Jonson, Minister of Health and Wellness, expressing concerns regarding the lack of resources being dedicated to the treatment and prevention of osteoporosis, and requesting that the prescription drug raloxifene be added to the provincial drug plan

Sessional Paper 674/2000

Members' Statements

Ms Olsen, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Norwood, made a statement regarding the peaceful protest of Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act, by approximately 500 Albertans on April 18, 2000, the importance of Members of the Legislative Assembly listening to their constituents, and the calm and professional manner in which the Legislative Assembly security and other staff carried out their duties during the demonstration.

ORDERS OF THE DAY

Public Bills and Orders Other Than Government Bills and Orders

Second Reading

On the motion that the following Bill be now read a Second time:

Bill 207 Provincial-Municipal Tax Sharing Calculation Act — Mrs. MacBeth

A debate followed.

During debate, Mr. Gibbons, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Manning, tabled the following:

Document dated April 18, 2000, entitled “Setting the Record Straight on Bill 207: Provincial-Municipal Tax Sharing Calculation Act” reiterating excerpts of the debate on Bill 207

Sessional Paper 675/2000

Pursuant to Standing Order 8(2)(b), debate adjourned, Mr. White speaking.

Motions Other Than Government Motions

507. Moved by Ms Leibovici

Be it resolved that the Legislative Assembly urge the Government to further increase the number of beds and improve standards for long-term care facilities and home care services with regard to staffing ratios and levels of service to adequate levels, and ensure that Regional Health Authority boundaries do not become barriers to placement.

The question being put, with Mr. Tannas in the Chair, the motion was defeated. The names being called for were taken as follows:

For the motion: 11

Blakeman	Massey	Sloan
Dickson	Olsen	Soetaert
Gibbons	Paul	White
Leibovici	Sapers	

Against the motion: 41

Broda	Hlady	Severtson
Burgener	Jacques	Shariff
Calahasen	Johnson	Smith
Cao	Klapstein	Stelmach
Coutts	Kryczka	Stevens
Ducharme	Laing	Strang
Fischer	Magnus	Tannas
Forsyth	Mar	Thurber
Friedel	Marz	Trynchy
Graham	McClellan	West
Haley	McFarland	Woloshyn
Hancock	Melchin	Yankowsky
Herard	Nelson	Zwozdesky
Hierath	Paszkowski	

508. Moved by Mr. Trynchy:

Be it resolved that the Legislative Assembly urge the Government to examine the results of the study undertaken by the Provincial Auto Insurance Crown Corporation of Québec - Société d'Assurance Automobile du Québec (SAAQ) on the dangers of hand-held cellular telephone use by drivers of motor vehicles, and then consult with Albertans on whether and what restrictions should be imposed on the use of hand-held cell phones by operators of motor vehicles while driving.

A debate followed.

Pursuant to Standing Order 8(2)(c), debate adjourned, Mr. Cao speaking.

Private Bills

Second Reading

The following Bills were read a Second time and referred to Committee of the Whole:

Bill	Pr1	Benevolent and Protective Order of Elks of the Province of Alberta Repeal Act — Mr. Coutts
Bill	Pr2	William Roper Hull Child and Family Services Amendment Act, 2000 — Mr. Stevens
Bill	Pr4	Calgary Municipal Heritage Properties Authority Amendment Act, 2000 — Mrs. Laing
Bill	Pr5	Calgary Foundation Act — Mrs. Burgener

Government Bills and Orders

Committee of the Whole

According to Order, the Assembly resolved itself into Committee of the Whole, and the Deputy Speaker left the Chair.

(Assembly in Committee)

Adjournment

Pursuant to Standing Order 4(3), at 5:30 p.m., the Committee recessed until 8:00 p.m.

TUESDAY, APRIL 18, 2000 — 8:00 P.M.

Government Bills and Orders

Committee of the Whole

(Assembly in Committee)

The following Bill was taken under consideration:

Bill 11 Health Care Protection Act — Hon. Mr. Jonson

After some time spent therein, Mr. Broda moved that the Committee rise and report progress. The question being put, with Mrs. Gordon in the Chair, the motion was agreed to. The names being called for were taken as follows:

For the motion: 33

Boutilier	Hierath	Paszkowski
Broda	Hlady	Severtson
Calahasen	Johnson	Shariff
Clegg	Jonson	Smith
Coutts	Kryczka	Stelmach
Doerksen	Laing	Stevens
Ducharme	Magnus	Strang
Evans	Mar	Thurber
Fischer	McClellan	Woloshyn
Forsyth	McFarland	Yankowsky
Hancock	Melchin	Zwozdesky

Against the motion: 12

Blakeman	Leibovici	Olsen
Bonner	MacBeth	Sapers
Carlson	MacDonald	Sloan
Dickson	Massey	White

The Acting Speaker assumed the Chair.

Progress was reported on the following Bill:

Bill 11 Health Care Protection Act — Hon. Mr. Jonson

Mr. Shariff, Hon. Member for Calgary-McCall, tabled copies of all amendments considered by the Committee of the Whole on this date for the official records of the Assembly.

Amendment to Bill 11 (Section A) (Introduced by the Minister of Health on and Wellness on April 12, 2000)

Sessional Paper 676/2000

Subamendment to the amendment to Bill 11 introduced by the Minister of Health on and Wellness on April 12, 2000 (Section A) (Ms Leibovici, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Meadowlark) — Debate adjourned

Sessional Paper 677/2000

Third Reading

The following Bills were read a Third time and passed.

Bill 4 Surveys Amendment Act, 2000 — Hon. Mr. Mar

Bill 2 First Nations Sacred Ceremonial Objects Repatriation Act — Hon. Ms Calahasen

Second Reading

On the motion that the following Bill be now read a Second time:

Bill 20 Justice Statutes Amendment Act, 2000 — Hon. Mr. Hancock

A debate followed.

Hon. Mrs. McClellan moved adjournment of the debate, which was agreed to.

Adjournment

On motion by Hon. Mr. Hancock, Government House Leader, the Assembly adjourned at 11:55 p.m. until Wednesday, April 19, 2000, at 1:30 p.m.

Hon. Ken Kowalski,
Speaker

Title: Tuesday, April 18, 2000